Approaches to Prostitution: Impact on Sex Trafficking

Donna M. Hughes
Carlson Endowed Chair
Women’s Studies Program
University of Rhode Island
Rhode Island, USA
Is Prostitution Harmful?

• No: View of those who support legalization or decriminalization
  - Oppose forced prostitution

• Yes: View of those who see prostitution as form of violence against women, abolitionists, Bush administration
  - “inherently harmful and dehumanizing”
Trafficking & Prostitution: Are They Linked?

- No: View of those who support legalization or decriminalization, Clinton administration

- Yes: View of those who see both prostitution and trafficking as form of violence against women, abolitionists, Bush administration

  “Prostitution and related activities...contribute to the phenomenon of trafficking in persons”
Approaches to Prostitution

- Four approaches to prostitution
  - Prohibition
  - Regulation
  - Decriminalization
  - Abolition
**Prohibition**

- Prostitution is a criminal activity – “vice”
- All activities are criminalized: soliciting, procuring, pimping, and brothel keeping
- All persons engaged in these activities are criminals
Prohibition, cont.

Prohibition in practice:

- Prohibition in law, but tolerance in practice
- Gender neutral laws, but women arrested the majority of the time
- Children are arrested & treated like criminals
- Less than 1% of arrests are pimps, brothel keepers, traffickers
Regulation/Legalization

- Prostitution is legalized
- Redefined as sex work
- Regulations control when, where, and how of sexual services
Regulation/Legalization

- The state collects tax revenue
- State approach in the Netherlands, Germany, and some states of Australia
- Counties in Nevada
Redefinition

- Prostitutes = sex workers
- Purchasers of sex acts = clients
- Pimps = managers
- Brothel owners = business people
- Traffickers = employment or travel agents who assist migrant sex workers
Results of Legalization

- The Netherlands – illegal prostitution went underground, expanded
- In Germany – criminals have not been turned into tax payers
- Big profits for exploiters
- Organized crime activity continued
- No reduction in prostitution or trafficking
Decriminalization

All laws and regulations concerning prostitution are removed

- Most popular approach supported by sex work advocates

- In reality: A transition to regulation or abolition
  - New Zealand
Tolerance, Decriminalization & Legalization

- Legitimizes prostitution and the sex trade – allowed to advertise, grow, expand, market their services
- Creates a demand for victims
- Legal sex trade increases illegal sex trade, i.e. the Netherlands, Australia
Abolition

- Prostitution a harmful activity
- Distinction is made between victims and perpetrators
Abolition

- Persons used in prostitution or sex trafficking are victims & offered services

- Johns, pimps, brothel keepers & traffickers are perpetrators & criminalized
Swedish Abolitionist Law, 1999

- Redefined prostitution as a form of violence against women
  - “...one of the most serious expressions of the oppression of discrimination against women”
- Purchasing a sex act became a crime
- Disruptive effect on men seeking to buy sex acts
- Reduced street prostitution by 80 percent
US Trafficking Victims Protection Acts

- Federal laws passed in 2000, 2003, 2005
- Supported by broad coalition of feminists, conservatives and faith-based groups
- Victim-centered approach
- Opposed by those who wanted to regulate trafficking and legalize prostitution
Abolition: National Philosophy

- Sweden: Prostitution is seen as a form of violence against women (1999, Redefined prostitution)

- US at Federal level (TVPA 2000): Sex trafficking of minor or using force, fraud, coercion is a form of slavery

- Different conceptualizations – violence against women or slavery -- but the impact is similar
U.S. Government Action

- 2001-2005: DOJ opened 480 new investigations
- Assisted 766 victims remain in US to assist with law enforcement efforts – “continued presence”
- 926 victims from 55 countries – eligible for benefits under TVPA 2000
  - Unaccompanied minors
  - Already have legal status
  - Self petitioners
U.S. Policy on Prostitution

- Congress voted to deny funding to groups that advocate for the legalization or regulation of prostitution or support prostitution as a legitimate form of work for women
- Bush administration supported & enacted this policy
March 2001: AG Ashcroft made trafficking a top civil rights priority

2002: President Bush signed NSPD – made combating trafficking a priority for all governmental departments

2001–2005: DOJ prosecuted 287 traffickers

A 260% increase - 1996-2000: 80 prosecutions

228 traffickers charged with sex trafficking
Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act 2005

- Passed unanimously by U.S. House and Senate, Dec 22, 2005
- Signed into law by President Bush, Jan 10, 2006

Deborah Pryce, Sam Brownback, George Bush, Chris Smith, Carolyn Maloney
TVPRA 2005, Title II

- Combating Domestic Trafficking in Persons provides funding for research, conferences, and programs relating to “sex trafficking” as defined in the TVPA 2000, not just “severe form of trafficking” involving commercial sex acts.

- Provides funds to local and state authorities to enforce anti-pimping, pandering, procuring laws. These laws do not require force, fraud, coercion.
Future Work of Abolitionist Approach

- Distinguish between victims and perpetrators
- Reduce demand factors
  - Criminalize and penalize the demand – purchasers of sex acts & exploiters
  - Eliminate state practices that facilitate trafficking
  - Education and awareness for cultural change
- Increase awareness of harm caused by prostitution and sex trafficking
  - Men who purchase sex acts
  - Pimps, traffickers & states who profit
Global Abolitionist Movement

- Abolitionist movement growing around the world
- Feminist issue
- Human rights struggle of our time
Surviving Sexual Slavery

“It is no small achievement to survive sexual slavery. Survivors are split into pieces, fragmented, broken, filled with despair, pain, rage, and sorrow. We have been hurt beyond belief … But we endure. We survive … We stay alive because we are women in search of our lives; we are women in search of freedom”

- Christine Grussendorf, 1997
Contact Details

Donna M. Hughes
316 Eleanor Roosevelt Hall
University of Rhode Island
http://www.uri.edu/artsci/wms/hughes
dhughes@uri.edu